CRI★TAC
Collaborative
Reform Initiative
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CENTER

Recruitment and Retention for Workforce Diversity

RESOURCE GUIDEBOOK | 2021

COPS
Community Oriented Policing Services
U.S. Department of Justice

IACP
International Association of
Chiefs of Police

Preface

The purpose of this guidebook is to provide the law enforcement field with information about existing resources for promoting workforce diversity through a variety of staffing mechanisms. It is not meant to be exhaustive, but rather to promote awareness of research and professional publications that may not have been visible or accessible to practitioners. Though limited, resources on this issue are growing, and this guidebook attempts to highlight publications that are unique, particularly insightful, or considered foundational. Most of these resources contain rich reference lists that will direct the reader to other literature on issues of interest.

What follows is a table of contents that lists each resource alphabetically by title and the page number that corresponds to its summary. To provide greater context for identifying resources that may be most useful for readers, the table of contents lists several staffing domains that are relevant to advancing diversity: creating a pipeline of officers, marketing, selection, staffing for recruitment, mentorship, organizational climate, career progression, analysis and benchmarking, and substantive focus on women and race/ethnicity. The table of contents provides page numbers that indicate which resources provide context on each domain and where it can be found in them. (Note there may be other locations where important information can be found that could inform the various domains, but the pages listed indicate where the information is discussed most directly.) This guidebook will help agencies further an evidence-based approach to facilitating diversity among their ranks.

Acknowledgments

The COPS Office would like to acknowledge the two Collaborative Reform Initiative Technical Assistance Center (CRI-TAC) subject matter experts who developed this guide, and without whose experience, expertise, and knowledge it would not have been possible:

Charles Scheer
Associate Professor, School of Criminal Justice, Forensic Science, and Security, The University of Southern Mississippi

Jeremy M. Wilson
Professor, School of Criminal Justice, Michigan State University

Contents

Page numbers from the resource providing context on indicated domain

Page numbers from the resource providing context on indicated domain

Page	Resource title	Pipeline	Marketing	Selection	Recruit staff	Mentorship	Organizational climate	Career progression	Analysis / benchmarking	Focus on women	Focus on race / ethnicity
7	The Glass Ceiling in Context: The Influence of CEO Gender, Recruitment Practices and Firm Internationalisation on the Representation of Women in Management	136; 142–143				135; 144	133–146	133–146		133–146	
8	Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success	5–27; 29–39; 41–49	35–39; 41–47	5–27	41–47	34; 42–43; 49	29–39; 45–49; 51–55	44–46	27	1–4; 10–13; 16–17; 26–27; 41–44; 47–49; 63–64	1–4; 16–17; 26–27; 41–44; 47–49
8	Interest in Police Patrol Careers: An Assessment of Potential Candidates' Impressions of the Police Recruitment, Selection, and Training Processes	5–10; 19–20; 21–24	5–10; 19–20; 21–24	19–20	5–10; 16; 19	6; 19–20	19–20; 21–24	5; 11; 15–16; 19		6; 10; 12; 19–20; 21–24	7–17; 19–20; 21–24
8	Investigating Perceptions of Race and Ethnic Diversity Among Prospective Police Officers	491–501				493	492–493	492–493; 497		498	491–501
9	Law Enforcement Best Practices: Lessons Learned from the Field	93–99; 107–108	102–105; 107–108	95–97; 104	103; 108	100; 108	93–99	97–98; 105–106; 109	94; 104–105; 108	97; 100–101	100–101
9	Levelling the Playing Field in Police Recruitment: Evidence from a Field Experiment on Test Performance	943–954		943–953			950–953			947–949; 952–953	943–954

Page	Resource title	Pipeline	Marketing	Selection	Recruit staff	Mentorship	Organizational climate	Career progression	Analysis / benchmarking	Focus on women	Focus on race / ethnicity
10	**The Model Police Officer: Recruitment, Training, & Community Engagement**	1–4; 4–9	4–9; 10–12	19–22; 27–30	4–9; 14–19	14–19	25–30			4–9; 10–12; 14–19; 25	4–9; 10–12; 15; 21
10	**More than Public Service: A Field Experiment on Job Advertisements and Diversity in the Police**	68–72	67–85						77–79	67–85	67–85
10	**Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium: The State of Knowledge**	3–60	72–79; 85–86	80–86	70–73	55; 58–59	70–73	37; 45–46; 51–52	68–69	33; 44; 63–64; 71	
11	**Recruiting and Retaining America's Finest: Evidence-Based Lessons for Police Workforce Planning**	41–55	23; 52–54; 68	13–39		63	13–40; 59–66	59–66	67–74	41–58; 55	55–58
11	**Recruiting and Retaining Officers in Small and Rural Agencies**			3–8	23–29; 31–34						
12	**Recruiting and Retaining Women: A Self-Assessment Guide for Law Enforcement**	43–90	33–40	63–90	46–58	93–102	33–39; 111–117; 159–161	119–145	149–157	21–222	133–146
12	**Recruitment & Retention: Best Practices Update**	55–78; 125–127; 129–138;	107–116; 125–127; 129–138	117–124	139–144	129–138	90–91; 169–174; 175–180	161–168; 181–188	91–93; 149	55–78; 109–111; 125–127; 129–137; 140	55-78; 109–111; 125–127; 129–137; 140

Page	Resource title	Pipeline	Marketing	Selection	Recruit staff	Mentorship	Organizational climate	Career progression	Analysis / benchmarking	Focus on women	Focus on race / ethnicity
12	**Strategies for Improving Officer Recruitment in the San Diego Police Department**	25–33; 45–76	15–19; 45–76	6–7; 19–22; 85–110	79–83	18; 22; 29; 31	22–25	22–23		31; 56–59; 81; 95	25; 81; 88; 91–93
13	**Thick Red Tape and the Thin Blue Line: A Field Study on Reducing Administrative Burden in Police Recruitment**	1–10		1–10			1–10			9	1; 6; 8
13	**Women in Policing: Breaking Barriers and Blazing a Path**	10–13	14–16	10–14		24	7–10; 24–27	6–7	5	iii–27	
13	**The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies are Doing About It**	19–32; 34–35; 37–42	49–50	44–45	15; 44–45; 47–50	10; 32; 38; 40–41; 45; 53–54	33–57	29–30; 52–54		42–46; 54–55	42–43

Resources

Title: **Behavioral Insights for Building the Police Force of Tomorrow**

Lead Author: Behavioral Insights Team

Date: January 2019

Location: https://www.bi.team/publications/behavioral-insights-for-building-the-police-force-of-tomorrow/

Abstract: Agencies across the U.S. reported career motivations of existing sworn staff to find promising practices for recruitment and retention. "Decision points" throughout the recruitment, selection, and career development process are detailed.

Title: **CRI-TAC Spotlight: Roundtable on Recruitment, Hiring, and Retention**

Lead Author: Collaborative Reform Initiative Technical Assistance Center (CRI-TAC)

Date: 2020

Location: https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-w0899-pub.pdf

Abstract: The West Greenwich (Rhode Island) Police Department requested assistance through CRI-TAC to host an event for local law enforcement agencies from Rhode Island and the surrounding areas to discuss regional challenges in recruitment, hiring, and retention. On January 29, 2020, CRI-TAC hosted Recruitment, Hiring, and Retention. National and Local Trends, a roundtable discussion in Portsmouth, Rhode Island. This document summarizes and annotates the discussions from that roundtable, supplemented by a list of additional resources.

Title: **The Decision to Become a Police Officer in a Legitimacy Crisis** (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Natalie Todak

Date: 2017

Location: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/08974454.2016.1256804?scroll=top&needAccess=true

Abstract: This study examines how individuals make the decision to become police officers in the context of a police legitimacy crisis and how men's and women's decision-making processes may be different. In-depth interviews were conducted with 42 criminal justice college students who want to become police officers. Prospective police officers anticipated facing challenges as a direct result

of the current climate surrounding American policing, which is characterized by decreased police legitimacy. On top of this, women anticipated facing more challenges than male officers due to their gender and underrepresentation in police work.

Title: Diversifying the Police Applicant Pool: Motivations of Women and Minority Candidates Seeking Police Employment (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Jennifer Gibbs

Date: 2019

Location: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/1478601X.2019.1579717?journalCode=gjup20

Abstract: This study provides contemporary insight into reasons women and minority candidates apply to a police department, asking respondents an open-ended question about their motivation to apply. Policing as a childhood dream, making a difference in the community and the opportunity to help people, and believing policing was a good transition from military to civilian life were the most-cited reasons for applying. Salary, benefits, and job security were the least-cited reasons for applying for a police position.

Title: An Examination of Recruiting and Selection Practices to Promote Diversity for Colorado State Troopers

Lead Author: Tracy Krueger

Date: 2019

Location: https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/3550/c88674c2d27fad206e51bf62fe2b7e7f9a41.pdf

Abstract: The Colorado State Patrol (CSP) seeks to better reflect the demographic representation of the state of Colorado. This report examines how the CSP's recruiting and selection policies and procedures relate to that objective. Barriers to diversity include the composition of the current workforce, the nature of the job, relocation requirements, and the lengthy hiring process. Recommendations include assessing propensity to apply, determining why applicants drop out, adjusting application windows, exploring strategies to shorten background investigations, and providing a realistic job preview.

Title: Examining a Ferguson Effect on College Students' Motivation to Become Police Officers (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Weston Morrow

Date: 2019

Location: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10511253.2019.1619793

Abstract: The study highlights how the negative attention directed towards law enforcement is adversely influencing college students' motivation to enter the police profession. Law enforcement agencies must make a concerted effort to mitigate such negative scrutiny to ensure a strong candidate pool for prospective police officers.

Title: Four Steps to Bring More Women into Policing (membership required)

Lead Author: Samantha Clinkinbeard

Date: 2020

Location: https://www.policechiefmagazine.org/four-steps-to-bring-more-women-into-policing/

Abstract: Agencies are encouraged to take proactive steps in defining the desired characteristics in candidates, assembling the right people for the recruitment effort, experimenting with different techniques, and assessing strategies for efficacy in producing results.

Title: The Glass Ceiling in Context: The Influence of CEO Gender, Recruitment Practices and Firm Internationalisation on the Representation of Women in Management (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Eddy S. Ng

Date: 2017

Location: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1748-8583.12135

Abstract: This study investigated chief executive officer gender and the active recruitment of women as predictors of an organization's level of representation of women in management. Results from a survey of 278 firms indicated that the presence of a female chief executive officer and an organization's active recruitment of women are positively associated with a firm's percentage of women in management.

Title: Hiring for the 21st Century Law Enforcement Officer: Challenges, Opportunities, and Strategies for Success

Lead Author: COPS Office / Police Executive Research Forum

Date: 2017

Location: https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-w0831-pub.pdf

Abstract: This monograph examines the landscape of contemporary approaches to recruitment by detailing agencies' experiences with specific strategies, such as the relaxation of selection criteria, the examination of human resources barriers, and the use of educational and other lifestyle incentives.

Title: Interest in Police Patrol Careers: An Assessment of Potential Candidates' Impressions of the Police Recruitment, Selection, and Training Processes

Lead Author: Charles Scheer

Date: 2018

Location: https://www.usm.edu/criminal-justice-forensic-science-security/police_report_scheer.pdf

Abstract: This project reports responds to a comprehensive survey issued to college students at five United States university programs asking for impressions of the recruitment, selection, and training processes for police patrol positions. Findings include reasons for perception of barriers to entry involving generational differences, lack of career information, lack of mentoring and guidance through the selection process, and aversion to patrol work because of community perception.

Title: Investigating Perceptions of Race and Ethnic Diversity Among Prospective Police Officers (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Natalie Todak

Date: 2018

Location: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/15614263.2018.1428097

Abstract: This research examined perceptions of police race, ethnicity, and diversity in a sample of 42 criminal justice college students in the southwestern United States who wanted to become police officers. Interviews illustrated they supported diversity in policing, collectively expressed a

belief that race plays a central role in policing today, and expressed support for the ideals of both passive and active representative bureaucracy. Hispanics in the sample anticipated they would positively affect police relations in Hispanic neighborhoods and encourage immigrants to cooperate with police.

Title: Law Enforcement Best Practices: Lessons Learned from the Field

Lead Author: COPS Office

Date: 2019

Location: https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-w0875-pub.pdf

Abstract: The U.S. Department of Justice's Office of Community Oriented Policing Services (COPS Office) examines key areas for community policing. These areas include de-escalation; crisis intervention; first-line supervisors; early intervention systems; internal affairs; recruitment, hiring, promotion, and retention; and data systems.

Title: Levelling the Playing Field in Police Recruitment: Evidence from a Field Experiment on Test Performance (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Elizabeth Linos

Date: 2017

Location: https://onlinelibrarywiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/padm.12344

Abstract: This study reports the results of a randomized controlled trial (RCT) in a police force that was experiencing a disproportionate drop in minority applicants during one particular test. Drawing on insights from the literatures on stereotype threat, belonging uncertainty, and values affirmation exercises, the authors redesigned the wording on the email inviting applicants to participate in the test. The results show a 50 percent increase in the probability of passing the test for minority applicants in the treatment group, with no effect on white applicants.

Title: **The Model Police Officer: Recruitment, Training, and Community Engagement**

Lead Author: International City/County Management Association and Vera Institute of Justice

Date: September 2018

Location: https://icma.org/documents/model-police-officer-recruitment-training-and-community-engagement

Abstract: This 25-jurisdiction survey of recruitment topics delved into the recruiting, training, and community relations expectations of a wide range of police and sheriff's offices. The monograph lists potential promising practices as stated by survey respondents for a host of agency goals, including strategies for recruitment for diversity.

Title: **More than Public Service: A Field Experiment on Job Advertisements and Diversity in the Police**

Lead Author: Elizabeth Linos

Date: 2018

Location: https://academic.oup.com/jpart/article/28/1/67/4590248

Abstract: This study presents the results of a field experiment aimed at attracting more and different people to apply to a police force by varying job advertisements in a postcard. The results suggest that focusing on public service motivation (PSM) messages is ineffective at attracting candidates who would not have applied anyway. Rather, messages that focus on the personal benefits of applying to the job—either emphasizing the challenge of the job or the career benefits—are three times as effective at getting individuals to apply as the control, without an observable loss in applicant quality.

Title: **Police Recruitment and Retention for the New Millennium: The State of Knowledge**

Lead Author: Jeremy M. Wilson

Date: 2010

Location: https://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG959.html

Abstract: This guidebook summarizes police practitioners' lessons on recruiting and retaining diverse, effective workforces. It provides a means for local officials to identify what has been tried elsewhere and what might be applicable in their own communities. It is a broad analysis of issues confronting many agencies and how these have developed over time. Each agency will face unique circumstances that it must consider in workforce planning; this monograph can provide guidance on relevant lessons learned elsewhere.

Title: Recruiting and Retaining America's Finest: Evidence-Based Lessons for Police Workforce Planning

Lead Author: Jeremy M. Wilson

Date: 2010

Location: https://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG960.html

Abstract: Recruitment and retention are tools for accomplishing a larger goal: achieving and maintaining the profile of officers by experience and rank that satisfies agency needs and officer career aspirations. In this monograph, the authors summarize a survey of every U.S. police agency with at least 300 sworn officers, seeking to document such characteristics as authorized and actual strength by rank, officer work and qualifications, compensation, and recruiting efforts. The authors overview current recruitment and retention practices and how they affect personnel profiles.

Title: Recruiting and Retaining Officers in Small and Rural Agencies

Lead Author: COPS Office

Date: 2020

Location: https://cops.usdoj.gov/RIC/Publications/cops-p426-pub.pdf

Abstract: This publication encompasses the challenges of law enforcement recruitment and retention in relation to smaller and rural law enforcement agencies. The topics discussed include the qualities that make an effective police officer, an in-depth examination of why people leave a department, and the significant challenges to recruiting and retaining officers.

Title: Recruiting and Retaining Women: A Self-Assessment Guide for Law Enforcement

Lead Author: National Center for Women in Policing

Date: June 2001

Location: https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/bja/185235.pdf

Abstract: This seminal research publication on the recruitment of women features a self-assessment guide for law enforcement agencies to evaluate their capacities for recruitment in creating teams, assessing local and regional resources, and capitalizing on existing strategies. The monograph contains an array of strategies which may fit agencies of all character.

Title: Recruitment & Retention: Best Practices Update

Lead Author: California POST

Date: April 2006

Location: http.//annex.ipacweb.org/library/conf/08/ca_post.pdf

Abstract: This detailed, step-by-step guide to promising practices in recruitment and retention lays out the demographic landscape and trends. The publication compiles myriad strategies, including identifying and developing recruitment personnel, identifying different venues for recruitment, and staffing and preview techniques.

Title: Strategies for Improving Officer Recruitment in the San Diego Police Department

Lead Author: Greg Ridgeway

Date: 2008

Location: https://www.rand.org/pubs/monographs/MG724.html

Abstract: The San Diego Police Department (SDPD) has been operating below its authorized size in recent years. To bridge its personnel gap, the department needs to maximize its recruiting while minimizing officer attrition. Specifically, the SDPD can optimize the recruiting process and manage recruiters and resources to achieve the maximum number of recruits. The authors assessed strategies for expanding the SDPD's applicant pool, evaluated the written-test process, and reviewed fitness-exam and background-check processes. As a result, they have specific recommendations to improve the SDPD's recruiting efforts. This monograph describes the study and its recommendations.

Title: **Thick Red Tape and the Thin Blue Line: A Field Study on Reducing Administrative Burden in Police Recruitment** (available for purchase)

Lead Author: Elizabeth Linos

Date: 2019

Location: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1111/puar.13115

Abstract: Using four years of administrative data and a field experiment conducted in the Los Angeles Police Department, the authors analyze the impact of administrative burden on the likelihood that a candidate will remain in the recruitment process. Findings show that reducing friction costs to participation and simplifying processes improve compliance, as behavioral public administration would predict. Applicants who were offered simpler, standardized processes completed more tests and were more likely to be hired.

Title: **Women in Policing: Breaking Barriers and Blazing a Path**

Lead Author: National Institute of Justice

Date: July 2019

Location: https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/252963.pdf

Abstract: Proceedings of the national conference on Women in Policing, this report summarizes the perspectives of managers from a national sample about the state of knowledge about recruiting, workforce growth, promotions, and career development for women in the field.

Title: **The Workforce Crisis, and What Police Agencies are Doing About It**

Lead Author: Police Executive Research Forum

Date: September 2019

Location: https://www.policeforum.org/assets/WorkforceCrisis.pdf

Abstract: Proceedings of the December 2018 summit conference on recruiting. This document summarizes input from a diverse sample of agency representatives speaking about their challenges and "what works" in navigating their specific crisis point.

The CRI-TAC Spotlight series is committed to advancing knowledge through sharing tools, resources, and information developed for the law enforcement field as a result of customized training and technical assistance delivered by CRI-TAC. This guide highlights and summarizes publications that provide the law enforcement field reference and resources for promoting workforce diversity.